Know the Gap, but also
Know about Implicit Bias

Walter S. Gilliam, PhD
Edward Zigler Center in Child Development & Social Policy
Yale University Child Study Center

Learn to Earn Dayton Readiness Summit
Know the Gap, Close the Gap
Dayton, Ohio
March 3, 2017
Federal Attention to Preschool Expulsion

White House Attention to Preschool Expulsion & ECMHC

DHHS & ED Joint Position Statement (12/10/2014)

ED’s OCR Data Collection; 2014 Reauthorization of CCDBG
CT Governor Malloy signs PA 15-96 (8/5/2015)
Expulsion Rates (per 1,000)

- K-12: 2.1
- PreK: 6.7
- Child Care: 27.4

Child Care Expulsion Rates

- **Child Rates**
  - Detroit, MI (Grannan et al., 1999; n=127; 28%)
    - Rate = 28/1,000
  - Massachusetts (Gilliam & Shahar, 2006; n=119; 64%)
    - Rate = 27/1,000 (39% Classes)
  - Massachusetts (MA DOE, 2003; n=764; ?%)
    - Rate = 2% expelled; 1% “suggested,” 1% transferred
  - Colorado (Hoover, 2006; n=1,075; 17%)
    - Rate = 10/1,000

- **Center/Classroom Rates**
  - Illinois (Cutler & Gilkerson, 2002; n=195 I/T; 38%)
    - Rate = 42% of Centers
  - Alaska (Alaska CCPO, 2005; n=493; 71%)
    - Rate = 35% Centers
Many Factors Predict Preschool Expulsion

**Child-Teacher Ratio**

- Under 8: 7.7%
- 8 to 9: 9.8%
- 10 to 11: 10.5%
- 12 and Up: 12.7%

**Program Length of Day**

- Half-Day: 7.1%
- School-Day: 9.0%
- Extended-Day: 13.2%

**Teacher Job Stress**

- Low Stress: 4.9%
- Average Stress: 9.3%
- High Stress: 14.3%

**Access to Behavioral Supports**

- No Access: 14.3%
- On-Call Access: 10.3%
- On-Site Access: 8.0%
Therefore, ...

Preschool Expulsion Is NOT a Child Behavior.

It is an Adult Decision.
Who Gets Expelled?

• 4-year-olds 50% more likely than 3’s

• Black preschoolers more than 2 times as likely as white preschoolers

• Boys more than 4 times as likely as girls
The 3 B’s of Expulsion Risk

• BIG

• BLACK

• BOY
The CBC takes notice (2007)

Congressman Danny K Davis
• US Representative (D-IL7)
• Congressional Black Caucus
• Education Committee

Jill Hunter-Williams, PhD
• Dep Chief of Staff
• HS ECMHC
• **March 2014 (2011-2012 data)**
  - “Black children make up 18% of preschool enrollment, but 48% of preschool children suspended more than once.”
  - “Boys receive more than three out of four out-of-school preschool suspensions.”

• **June 2016 (2013-2014 data)**
  - Black preschoolers 3.6 times as likely to be suspended as white preschoolers
  - Blacks represent 19% of preschoolers, but 47% of suspensions
  - Boys represent 54% of preschoolers, but 78% of suspensions
So, Why Are Our Boys and Our Black Children Most At Risk?

- Potential Reasons:
  - Boys are more susceptible to stressors (Autor et al, 2015).
  - Children of color *often* have more stressors.
  - Children of color *often* attend programs of poorer quality and fewer resources (Barnett et al, 2013).

- Yet, these alone don’t seem to account for all of the disparities in early suspensions and expulsions.
What Else May Account?

- Is it possible that implicit biases about our boys and especially our black boys may play a role?

  - Black boys more likely to be suspended/expelled for similar behaviors in elementary school (Skiba et al., 2011).

  - Biases about black boys
    - Older (Goff et al., 2014)
    - Culpable (Goff et al., 2014; Eberhardt et al., 2004; Todd et al., 2016)
    - Less likely to feel pain (Dore et al., 2014)

  - “Shifting Standards” (Harber et al., 2012)
Finally, A Study of Implicit Bias in ECE

- Jan 2015 – Funding (Thanks, W.K. Kellogg Foundation!)
- Nov 2015 – Collected Data
- Sep 2016 – Released Report of Findings
Participants (N = 132; 94% Female)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Classroom teacher</td>
<td>68.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center director</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student teachers</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (e.g., combination of professional roles)</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Center type</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faith-affiliated program</td>
<td>22.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School-based PreK</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not-for-profit</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Start</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For profit</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (e.g., independent school, special education)</td>
<td>31.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Race</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>66.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Experience</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Years working at current location</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years working in early education</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>9.10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Eye Tracking Procedures

- Instructions: “Now you are ready to view a series of video clips lasting 6 minutes. We are interested in learning about how teachers detect challenging behavior in the classroom. Sometimes this involves seeing behavior before it becomes problematic. The video segments you are about to view are of preschoolers engaging in various activities. Some clips may or may not contain challenging behaviors. Your job is to press the enter key on the external keypad every time you see a behavior that could become a potential challenge [experimenter demonstrates]. Please press the keypad as often as needed.”
Eye-Tracking Sample Clip
Eye Tracking Procedures
Areas of Interest
Which child required the most of your attention?

Please remember the letter of the child who you believe required the most of your attention.
Eye-Tracking Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Eye-tracking: Dwell Time (N=116)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black boy</td>
<td>0.2823</td>
<td>0.0699</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black girl</td>
<td>0.2584</td>
<td>0.0481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White boy</td>
<td>0.2258</td>
<td>0.0487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White girl</td>
<td>0.2334</td>
<td>0.0475</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Main: $\Lambda=.693$, $F=50.87$, $p<.001$, $d=1.33$.  
Interaction: $\Lambda=.925$, $F=9.36$, $p<.01$, $d=.57$. 

$\chi^2=39.09$, $p<.001$
Vignette Procedure

• Standardized vignette, manipulated child sex and race: DeShawn, Latoya, Jake, Emily

• “Act as if this child is in your classroom”

• Background or No Background
Vignette Results

- White teachers evidence lower behavioral standards for black children, but black teachers hold black children to relatively high standards.

- Teachers’ knowledge of family stressors tends to cause them to view behaviors as being less severe, but only if teacher and child race match. If racial mismatch, then opposite effect. (consistent with empathy research)

\[ F = 8.99, p = .004, \eta^2 = .10. \]

\[ F = 5.69, p = .019, \eta^2 = .06. \]
Blast Isn't Just A Police Problem, It's A Preschool Problem

September 28, 2016 - 5:00 AM ET
Heard on Morning Edition

A new study out of Yale found that pre-K teachers, white and black alike, spend more time watching black boys, expecting trouble.

LA Johnson/NPR

PRESCHOOL

nprEd HOW LEARNING HAPPENS
Why Care about Disparities in Early Expulsion?
Social Justice and Civil Rights Are Often Matters of Access
VALDOSTA A. Ga. Sept. 18 VALDOSTA COLLEGE DESEGREGATED—Two Negro students, Robert Pierce, 18, (left) and Drewell Thomas, 17, sit in Tuesday's freshman assembly program at Valdosta State College. Both of Valdosta, the Negroes are the first of their race to attend the school. They were voluntarily accepted by the state-supported college. There were no disorders.
Front Doors; Back Doors
“You got a little bias stuck between your teeth.”
Peach Trees & Babies
Thank You!  To Read More...

http://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/reports/issue_briefs/2016/rwjf431300/subassets/rwjf431300_2

Random-Controlled Evaluation of ECMHC (Sep 2016)
http://www.jaacap.com/

Yale Preschool Implicit Bias Study (Sep 2016)
www.ziglercenter.yale.edu/publications/briefs.aspx

National Academy of Sciences (Oct 2016)

Preschool Suspension & Expulsion Timeline
www.ziglercenter.yale.edu/publications/expulsion.aspx

Follow me on Twitter: @WalterGilliam